Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Bob Faith Founder, Chairman, and CEO Greystar 465 Meeting St, Suite 500 Charleston, SC 29403

Dear Mr. Faith:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Greystar's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Greystar uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Toby Bozzuto President and CEO Bozzuto Group 6406 Ivy Ln, Suite 700 Greenbelt, MD 20770

Dear Mr. Bozzuto:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Bozzuto Group's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Bozzuto Group uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. ¹⁶ Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington. DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Clay Duvall and David Binswanger Co-CEO Lincoln Property 8111 Douglass Avenue, Suite 600 Dallas, TX 75225

Dear Mr. Duvall and Mr. Binswanger:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Lincoln Property's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housingneeds-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm. ³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan

Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/vieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-toreview-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Lincoln Property uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Mark Parrell President and CEO Equity Residential 2 N Riverside Plaza Chicago, IL 60606

Dear Mr. Parrell:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Equity Residential's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Equity Residential uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. ¹⁶ Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Brian Kingston CEO Brookfield Properties Brookfield Place New York 250 Vesey Street, 15th Floor New York, NY 10281

Dear Mr. Kingston:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Brookfield Properties' reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan

ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ry Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Brookfield Properties uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Terry Considine CEO AIR Communities 4582 S. Ulster St. Suite 1700 Denver, CO 80237

Dear Mr. Considine:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding AIR Communities' reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ D. D. Hiller, "Developing the Property of the Control of the Control of the Property of the Proper

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that AIR Communities uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Terry Considine CEO AIR Communities 4582 S. Ulster St. Suite 1700 Denver, CO 80237

Dear Mr. Considine:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding AIR Communities' reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ D. D. Hiller, "Developing the Property of the Control of the Control of the Property of the Proper

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that AIR Communities uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Benjamin Schall President and CEO AvalonBay Communities 4040 Wilson Blvd. Suite 1000 Arlington, VA 22203

Dear Mr. Schall:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding AvalonBay Communities' reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ Pro Publica "Port Coing Line One Company" Alexaidary Could Be Wise "Heather Vegell, Hery Company and Business and Proposition of the Could Be Wise "Heather Vegell, Hery Company and Business and Proposition of the Could Be Wise "Heather Vegell, Hery Company and Business and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that AvalonBay Communities uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Lili Dunn
President and CEO
Bell Partners
300 N Greene Street
Suite 1000
Greensboro, NC 27401

Dear Ms. Dunn:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Bell Partners' reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan

Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Bell Partners uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Michelle M. MacKay CEO Cushman and Wakefield 225 W Wacker Dr, Suite 3000 Chicago, IL 60606

Dear Ms. MacKay:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Cushman and Wakefield's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ P. P. Higher Grind Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Cushman and Wakefield uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Sue Ansel President and CEO Gables Residential 3399 Peachtree Road NE Atlanta, GA 30326

Dear Ms. Ansel:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Gables Residential's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ D. D. Hiller, "Developing the Property of the Control of the Control of the Property of the Proper

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Gables Residential uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments.¹⁶ Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Jeff Blau CEO Related Companies 30 Hudson Yards New York, NY 10001

Dear Mr. Blau:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding Related Companies' reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that Related Companies uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Thomas Toomey Chairman and CEO UDR 1745 Shea Center Drive Suite 200 Highlands Ranch, CO 80129

Dear Mr. Toomey:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding UDR's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan

Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that UDR uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. ¹⁶ Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton

Washington, DC 20515

September 18, 2024

Patrick Appleby President WinnResidential One Washington Mall, Suite 500 Boston, MA 02018

Dear Mr. Appleby:

In the wake of the Department of Justice's new antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, we write with significant concern regarding WinnResidential's reported use of RealPage's YieldStar or AI Internal Management (AIRM) products, the centerpieces of an alleged price-fixing scheme to hike rents for Americans across the country.

Massachusetts is in the midst of a housing affordability crisis; rents in the Commonwealth are currently the highest in the country. In the midst of this crisis, we are extraordinarily concerned that corporate landlords are taking advantage of renters in Massachusetts, gouging them with illegal price-fixing schemes.

¹ Rent, "The Rent.Report April 2024," April 15, 2024, https://www.rent.com/research/average-rent-price-report/; National Low Income Housing Coalition, "Housing Needs By State: Massachusetts," https://nlihc.org/housing-needs-by-state/massachusetts.

² Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Bernie Sanders, and Tina Smith to RealPage CEO Dana Jones, November 23, 2022, https://www.warren.senate.gov/download/20221122-letter-to-realpage-re-yieldstar-algorithm.

³ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

⁴ *Id*.

⁵ Letter from Senators Elizabeth Warren, Ed Markey, Tina Smith, and Bernie Sanders to the Department of Justice, March 3, 2023, https://www.warren.senate.gov/oversight/letters/warren-lawmakers-urge-justice-department-to-review-yieldstar-warn-of-de-facto-price-setting-and-collusion-after-senate-investigation.

Last month, the Justice Department and attorneys general in eight states filed a major antitrust lawsuit against RealPage, alleging an "unlawful scheme to decrease competition among landlords in apartment pricing and to monopolize the market for commercial revenue management software that landlords use to price apartments." The allegations in the complaint reveal even more information about RealPage's alleged price-fixing scheme.

First, according to the DOJ's complaint, RealPage's strategy extended far beyond its pricing algorithm. RealPage allegedly held monthly "user group" meetings, where competing landlords would attend—including at one meeting, "five of the largest property management companies in the country"—and discussed business strategies including managing lease expirations and renewal pricing. To facilitate the sharing of confidential information, RealPage set up a call center to make tens of thousands of calls each month, gathering nonpublic information on rent price, occupancy rates, lease terms, and more. According to the DOJ, some of the landlords used Google Drive documents to share sensitive, proprietary information.

Second, belying RealPage's claims that their software's pricing recommendations are "non-binding," RealPage allegedly exerted significant pressure on landlords to accept their recommendations. RealPage's software included an "auto accept" feature which automatically adjusts rents for property managers. ¹¹ If a landlord or property manager did reject a recommendation, a "pricing advisor" from RealPage reached out and pushed them to take the recommendation. ¹² The complaint further alleges that "RealPage takes no steps to avoid assigning the same pricing advisor to properties with different owners, even if those properties compete with each other or are RealPage-mapped competitors." ¹³ As alleged by the DOJ, collusion is at the heart of RealPage's scheme, not an incidental effect.

⁶ *Id*.

⁷ Department of Justice, Office of Public Affairs, "Justice Department Sues RealPage for Algorithmic Pricing Scheme that Harms Millions of American Renters," August 23, 2024, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/justice-department-sues-realpage-algorithmic-pricing-scheme-harms-millions-american-renters.

⁸ Complaint, U.S. Department of Justice vs. RealPage, Inc., U.S. District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina, 1:24-cv-00710, 2024, pp. 35-36.

⁹ *Id.*, p. 7.

¹⁰ *Id.*, p. 31.

¹¹ *Id.*, p. 25.

¹² *Id.*, p. 23.

¹³ *Id.*, p. 30.

¹⁴ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent.

¹⁵ ProPublica, "Rent Going Up? One Company's Algorithm Could Be Why," Heather Vogell, Haru Coryne and Ryan Little, October 15, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/yieldstar-rent-increase-realpage-rent; ProPublica,

Colluding to price gouge renters is unacceptable and illegal. Plaintiffs suing RealPage have alleged that WinnResidential uses YieldStar or AIRM to set prices for your apartments. Accordingly, given your company's significant presence in Massachusetts, we ask that you provide answers to the following questions by October 3, 2024.

- 1. When did your company begin using RealPage's YieldStar or AIRM product in Massachusetts?
- 2. Do you currently use the product?
 - a. If so, will you commit to cutting ties with RealPage and permanently ending your use of YieldStar and/or AIRM?
 - b. If not, when did you stop using the product?
- 3. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what was the average annual rent increase for your properties in Massachusetts?
- 4. Does your company ever lease at prices below the hard floor recommended by AIRM or YieldStar? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 5. Does your company inform RealPage whenever you lease out units in your properties? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 6. Are your company's leasing agents in contact with RealPage's pricing advisors? If so, how often do they communicate and what types of information do your agents typically share? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 7. Has your company participated in RealPage's "user group" meetings? If so, how often does it do so? What information is exchanged in these meetings? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 8. Does your company use RealPage's "auto accept" option, which automatically adjusts rents based on RealPage's algorithm? How often does your company accept RealPage's rent recommendations? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 9. For the time period that you used YieldStar or AIRM, what has been the vacancy rate across your properties in Massachusetts each year? Does your company ever hold units vacant, rather than lower prices, if you are unable to find a tenant?
- 10. Does your company collect data on renters and share it with other landlords, whether through RealPage or through other means? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

[&]quot;5 Takeaways From Our Investigation Into RealPage's Rent-Setting Algorithm," Sophia Kovatch, October 28, 2022, https://www.propublica.org/article/why-rent-is-so-high.

¹⁶ Multifamily Dive, "DC files suit against RealPage, 14 landlords," Leslie Shaver, November 3, 2023, https://www.multifamilydive.com/news/Attorney-General-RealPage-landlords-anti-trust-suit-price-fixing/698765/; United States District Court, Middle District of Tennessee, Realpage Inc., Rental Software Antitrust Litigation (No. II), Case no. 3:23-md-3071, https://www.tnmd.uscourts.gov/mdl-case-information.

- 11. Does your company participate in any shared Google Drive documents containing proprietary information with RealPage or other landlords? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.
- 12. Does your company respond to RealPage's call center requests for proprietary information or participate in RealPage's multifamily housing survey? If your company doesn't currently work with RealPage, please respond for the time period in which you used RealPage's products.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth Warren

United States Senator

Edward J. Markey

United States Senator

Seth Moulton