117th CONGRESS 2D Session

C	
$\mathbf{N}$	

To enhance protections of civilians during United States military operations, and for other purposes.

# IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

Ms. WARREN introduced the following bill; which was read twice and referred to the Committee on \_\_\_\_\_

# A BILL

To enhance protections of civilians during United States military operations, and for other purposes.

1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-

2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,

# **3** SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.

4 This Act may be cited as the "Protection of Civilians"

5 in Military Operations Act".

# 6 SEC. 2. SENSE OF CONGRESS.

7 It is the sense of Congress—

8 (1) to commend the Department of Defense for
9 its renewed commitment to preventing and address10 ing harm to civilians resulting from United States

1	military operations and work to develop an action
2	plan to implement meaningful changes to further
3	prevent and address such harm;
4	(2) to agree with the Department that harms to
5	civilians is a tragic and unavoidable part of war, and
6	to recognize that—
7	(A) the Department endeavors to conduct
8	all military operations in compliance with the
9	international law of armed conflict and the laws
10	of the United States, including distinction, pro-
11	portionality, and the requirement to take fea-
12	sible precautions in planning and conducting
13	operations to reduce the risk of harm to civil-
14	ians and other protected persons and objects;
15	(B) the protection of civilians and other
16	protected persons and objects, in addition to a
17	legal obligation and a strategic interest, is a
18	moral and ethical imperative;
19	(C) despite those commitments, military
20	operations of the United States and partner
21	countries during the two decades before the
22	date of the enactment of this Act have resulted
23	in civilian deaths and injuries, and damage to
24	or destruction of civilian objects including crit-

3

1 ical infrastructure, in at least Afghanistan, 2 Iraq, Pakistan, Somalia, Syria, and Yemen; and 3 (D) more must be done to improve the pro-4 tection of civilians; 5 (3) that the Department has submitted to Con-6 gress four successive annual reports on civilian cas-7 ualties resulting from United States military oper-8 ations for calendar years 2017, 2018, 2019, and 9 2020, and has updated reports as appropriate; and 10 (4) to recognize the efforts of the Department, 11 both in policy and in practice, to reduce the harm 12 to civilians and other protected persons and objects 13 resulting from United States military operations, 14 and to encourage the Department to make addi-15 tional progress in— 16 (A) developing at all combatant commands 17 personnel and offices responsible for advising 18 the commanders of such commands, and inte-19 grating into command strategy, the promotion 20 of observance of human rights and the protec-21 tion of civilians and other protected persons 22 and objects; 23 (B) finalizing and implementing the policy 24 of the Department relating to civilian casualties

25 resulting from United States military oper-

4

ations, as required by section 936 of the John
 S. McCain National Defense Authorization Act
 for Fiscal Year 2019 (Public Law 115–232; 10
 U.S.C. 134 note);

5 (C) finalizing and implementing Depart-6 ment-wide regulations to implement section 7 1213 of the National Defense Authorization for 8 Fiscal Year 2020 (Public Law 116–92; 10 9 U.S.C. 2731 note), for ex gratia payments for 10 damage, personal injury, or death that is inci-11 dent to the use of force by the United States 12 Armed Forces, a coalition that includes the 13 United States, a military organization sup-14 porting the United States, or a military organization supporting the United States or such co-15 16 alition; and

(D) professionalizing foreign partner forces
to minimize, mitigate, and respond to harm to
civilians, including in connection with arms
transfers, train and equip programs, advise, assist, accompany, and enable missions, and fully
combined and coalition operations.

## 23 SEC. 3. INTEGRITY OF CIVILIAN HARM INVESTIGATIONS.

24 (a) INVESTIGATIONS BY OFFICERS OUTSIDE UNIT25 OR CHAIN OF COMMAND.—A commander in the Armed

5

Forces conducting an administrative investigation, com mander directed inquiry, or equivalent investigation of
 harms to civilians resulting from a United States military
 operation that was undertaken by one or more units under
 the command of the commander shall—

6 (1) to the extent practicable, select as an officer
7 to conduct such investigation an officer in the
8 Armed Forces outside of such units or chain of com9 mand; or

(2) if selecting an officer outside of such units
or chain of command is not practicable, include an
explanation in the investigative report and submit to
the Center of Excellence described in section 7 a report describing the reasons such a selection was not
practicable.

16 (b) SEPARATION OF INVESTIGATIVE PERSONNEL 17 FROM PERSONNEL INVOLVED IN OPERATIONS.—The military or civilian personnel of the Armed Forces who 18 19 conduct an investigation on civilian casualties resulting 20 from a United States military operation shall, to the ex-21 tent practicable, be operationally separate from members 22 of the Armed Forces who were directly involved in such 23 operation.

24 (c) WITNESS INTERVIEWS AND SITE VISITATIONS IN
25 INVESTIGATIONS.—

1	(1) IN GENERAL.—Each investigation of harm
2	to civilians resulting from a United States military
3	operation shall, to the extent practicable, include—
4	(A) interviews (remotely if necessary) of ci-
5	vilian survivors and witnesses (after obtaining
6	their informed consent), including first respond-
7	ers and local medical authorities, and witnesses
8	that may have moved to other locations; and
9	(B) a visit by appropriate members of the
10	United States Armed Forces to each site at
11	which civilian casualties were confirmed or rea-
12	sonably suspected in connection with such oper-
13	ation.
14	(2) INTERVIEWS OR VISITS BY ALTERNATIVE
15	PERSONNEL.—If the Secretary of Defense deter-
16	mines that an interview described in subparagraph
17	(A) of paragraph (1) or a visit described in subpara-
18	graph (B) of that paragraph is not practicable, the
19	Secretary shall—
20	(A) memorialize, in writing, the justifica-
21	tion for such determination;
22	(B) make every reasonable effort to obtain,
23	as the case may be—
24	(i) such an interview; or

1	(ii) a visit by appropriate military or
2	civilian personnel of a partner or coalition
3	military force, or by personnel of the na-
4	tional government concerned, or a local
5	government, capable of making such a visit
6	in connection with the investigation con-
7	cerned; and
8	(C) memorialize, in writing—
9	(i) the results of any interview or visit
10	under subparagraph (B); or
11	(ii) if no interview or visit could be
12	obtained under that subparagraph, the
13	gaps in evidence in the investigation con-
14	cerned as a result of the lack of such an
15	interview or visit, as the case may be.
16	(d) Consideration of Civil Society Informa-
17	TION.—Each investigation of harm to civilians resulting
18	from a United States military operation shall—
19	(1) to the extent practicable, obtain and incor-
20	porate open-source information and civil society doc-
21	umentation regarding the possible incident of harm
22	to civilians;
23	(2) consider all sources of relevant and credible
24	reporting, including information from public reports
25	and nongovernmental sources; and

8

(3) include a reporting mechanism for the re ceipt and processing of information received under
 paragraphs (1) and (2) that is relevant to the inves tigation, including online portals.

# 5 SEC. 4. COORDINATION BETWEEN GEOGRAPHIC COMBAT-

# 6

7

# ANT COMMANDS AND SPECIAL OPERATIONS COMMAND AND THE DEPARTMENT OF STATE.

8 (a) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 180 days after the 9 date of the enactment of this Act, the Secretary of Defense 10 shall direct each commander of a geographic combatant command and the Commander of the United States Spe-11 12 cial Operations Command to coordinate with the Depart-13 ment of State to establish and maintain an uninterrupted 14 line of communication between such commands and the 15 Chief of Mission (or the Chief's designee) in any country in which any such command is conducting military oper-16 17 ations in order to assist in the response to reports of harm to civilians resulting from such military operations. 18

(b) PRIMARY OBJECTIVE.—The primary objective of
the line of communication under this section shall be to
serve as a channel for fielding and coordinating reports
of harm to civilians resulting from United States military
operations undertaken by the command concerned in the
country or operation concerned.

# 1 SEC. 5. DATABASE ON REPORTS ON ASSESSMENTS AND IN-2 VESTIGATIONS.

3 (a) DATABASE REQUIRED.—Not later than one year 4 after the date of the enactment of this Act, the Secretary 5 of Defense shall establish and maintain within the Department of Defense a database that preserves and organizes 6 7 reports of the Department on assessments and investiga-8 tions of harm to civilians resulting from United States 9 military operations (including reports under section 1057 10 of the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 11 2018), and the status and results of such assessments and 12 investigations.

(b) SEARCHABILITY.—The database required by subsection (a) shall be searchable by personnel across the Department.

16 (c) AVAILABILITY TO PUBLIC.—The public shall have 17 access to, and be able to search, the database required 18 by subsection (a) through an internet website of the De-19 partment that is available to the public. For purposes of 20 such access, appropriate information in the database may be maintained in a classified annex in the interests of the 21 22 national security of the United States, and access to such 23 annex appropriately limited.

24 (d) UPDATE.—The database required by subsection
25 (a) shall be updated not less frequently than once every
26 30 days.

10

1 (e) PAST REPORTS ON CIVILIAN HARM.—The data-2 base required by subsection (a) shall include, to the extent 3 practicable, any Department of Defense reports already 4 conducted on assessments and investigations of harm to 5 civilians resulting from United States military operations between January 1, 2001, and the date of the enactment 6 7 of this Act, as well as any reports conducted retroactively. 8 SEC. 6. RESOURCES TO IMPLEMENT DEPARTMENT OF DE-9 FENSE POLICY ON CIVILIAN HARM IN CON-10 NECTION WITH UNITED STATES MILITARY 11 **OPERATIONS.** 

(a) PURPOSE.—The purpose of this section is to facilitate fulfillment of the requirements in section 936 of
the John S. McCain National Defense Authorization Act
for Fiscal Year 2019 (Public Law 115–232; 10 U.S.C.
134 note).

17 (b) PERSONNEL.—Not later than 180 days after the18 date of the enactment of this Act, the Secretary of Defense19 shall do the following:

(1) Add to, and assign within, each of the
United States Central Command, the United States
Africa Command, the United States Special Operations Command, the United States European Command, the United States Southern Command, the
United States Indo-Pacific Command, and the

United States Northern Command not fewer than
 two personnel who shall have primary responsibility
 for the following in connection with military oper ations undertaken by such command:

5 (A) Providing guidance and oversight re-6 lating to prevention of and response to harm to 7 civilians, promotion of observance of human 8 rights, and the protection of civilians and civil-9 ian infrastructure, including ensuring imple-10 mentation of the policy of the Department of 11 Defense on harm to civilians resulting from 12 United States military operations.

(B) Overseeing civilian harm prevention,
mitigation, and response functions on behalf of
the commander of such command.

16 (C) Receiving reports of harm to civilians
17 and conducting assessments and investigations
18 relating to such harm.

19 (D) Analyzing incidents and trends with
20 respect to harm to civilians, identifying lessons
21 learned, and ensuring that lessons learned are
22 incorporated into updated command guidance
23 and practices.

24 (E) Offering condolences and amends for25 harm to civilians, including ex gratia payments.

	1-
1	(F) Ensuring the integration of activities
2	relating to civilian harm prevention, mitigation,
3	and response, the protection of civilians, and
4	promotion of observance of human rights in se-
5	curity cooperation activities.
6	(G) Working with the Center of Excellence
7	established under section 7.
8	(H) Consulting with non-governmental or-
9	ganizations on civilian harm and human rights
10	matters.
11	(2) Add to, and assign within, the Office of the
12	Under Secretary of Defense for Policy not fewer
13	than two personnel who shall have primary responsi-
14	bility for implementing and overseeing implementa-
15	tion by the components of the Department of De-
16	fense of Department policy on harm to civilians re-
17	sulting from United States military operations.
18	(3) Add to, and assign within, the Joint Staff
19	not fewer than two personnel who shall have primary
20	responsibility for the following:
21	(A) Overseeing implementation by the com-
22	ponents of the Department of Defense of De-
23	partment policy on harm to civilians resulting
24	from United States military operations.

	10
1	(B) Developing and sharing in the imple-
2	mentation of such policy.
3	(C) Communicating operational guidance
4	on such policy.
5	(c) TRAINING, SOFTWARE, AND OTHER REQUIRE-
6	MENTS.—
7	(1) IN GENERAL.—In each of fiscal years 2023
8	through 2025, the Secretary of Defense and each
9	Secretary of a military department may obligate and
10	expend, from amounts specified in paragraph $(2)$ ,
11	not more than \$5,000,000 for the following:
12	(A) Training related to civilian harm pre-
13	vention, mitigation, and response.
14	(B) Information technology equipment,
15	support and maintenance, and data storage, in
16	order to implement—
17	(i) the policy of the Department relat-
18	ing to harms to civilians resulting from
19	United States military operations as re-
20	quired by section 936 of the John S.
21	McCain National Defense Authorization
22	Act for Fiscal Year 2019; and
23	(ii) the database required by section
24	5.

1	(2) FUNDS.—The funds for a fiscal year speci-
2	fied in this subparagraph are funds as follows:
3	(A) In the case of the Secretary of De-
4	fense, amounts authorized to be appropriated
5	for such fiscal year for operation and mainte-
6	nance, Defense-wide.
7	(B) In the case of a Secretary of a military
8	department, amounts authorized to be appro-
9	priated for such fiscal year for operation and
10	maintenance for the components of the Armed
11	Forces under the jurisdiction of such Secretary.
12	SEC. 7. DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE CENTER OF EXCEL-
13	LENCE FOR THE PROTECTION OF CIVILIANS.
14	(a) IN GENERAL.—Chapter 4 of title 10, United
15	States Code, is amended by adding at the end the fol-
16	lowing new section:
17	"§148 Center of Excellence for the Protection of Ci-
18	vilians
19	"(a) CENTER OF EXCELLENCE FOR THE PROTEC-
20	TION OF CIVILIANS.—There is within the Office of the
21	Secretary of Defense a Center of Excellence for the Pro-
22	tection of Civilians (in this section referred to as the 'Cen-
23	ter').

15

"(b) FUNCTIONS AND COMPOSITION.—The Center
 shall serve as the primary organization in the Department
 of Defense responsible for—

4 "(1) advising the Secretary of Defense and sen5 ior United States Government officials on efforts to
6 prevent, mitigate, and respond to harm to civilians
7 during United States military operations;

8 "(2) ensuring the full implementation of the 9 Department of Defense Instruction on Responding 10 to Civilian Harm in Military Operations and subse-11 quent guidance pertaining to civilian harm preven-12 tion, mitigation, and response;

13 "(3) conducting regular audits of civilian harm 14 prevention, mitigation, and response policies and 15 practices across the Department of Defense, includ-16 ing at the combatant commands, including align-17 ment of Department policies, practices, and other 18 guidance with the law of armed conflict and other 19 applicable international law;

"(4) convening on a quarterly basis an interagency task force to assess progress on civilian harm
prevention, mitigation, and response, which shall include the Department of Defense, the Department of
State, the Central Intelligence Agency, the United
States Agency for International Development, and

16

such other agencies as the President considers ap propriate;

3 "(5) tracking data relating to harm to civilians,
4 analyzing such data over time for trends, and ensur5 ing the public release of such data on a regular
6 basis;

7 "(6) conducting post-strike assessments and in-8 vestigations of suspected harm to civilians, including 9 wherever possible interviews with victims and sur-10 vivors, and in consultation with civil society organi-11 zations and relevant United States Government 12 agencies, and publicly releasing all such assessments 13 and investigations with minimal redactions only for 14 legitimately classified information;

"(7) based on post-strike assessments, investigations, and trend analysis, recommending individual amends and remedies for harm to civilians,
recommending accountability measures in cases of
wrongdoing, and suggesting changes to policy and
practice based on findings;

21 "(8) issuing amends for harm to civilians
22 caused by the use of force by the United States
23 Armed Forces, a coalition that includes the United
24 States, a military organization supporting the
25 United States, or a military organization supporting

17

the United States or such coalition, including formal
 apologies, ex gratia payments, and other assistance,
 in consultation with civilian victims, survivors, and
 their representatives;

"(9) engaging with civil society no less than bi-5 6 annually to ensure the most accurate and com-7 prehensive information about harm to civilians is 8 known to the United States Government and that 9 United States Government efforts to improve civilian 10 harm policies and practice are informed by the expe-11 riences and needs of civilians affected by military op-12 erations of the United States and partner countries; 13 "(10) conducting assessments and investiga-14 tions and reporting on instances of civilian harm that have occurred in the past; and 15

"(11) ensuring that lessons learned from civilian harm assessments, investigations, and other
sources are reflected in updated doctrine, policies,
procedures, and practices, and monitoring and assessing implementation of lessons learned.

"(c) DIRECTOR.—(1) There is a Director of the Center, who shall be the head of the Center, and who shall
be appointed by the Secretary of Defense. The Director
of the Center shall be a civilian with significant experience
and expertise relating to the protection of civilians.

18

"(2) The Director of the Center shall— 1 2 "(A) report directly to the Secretary of De-3 fense; and 4 "(B) carry out the functions of the Center 5 under subsection (b). 6 "(d) STAFF.—The Center shall have sufficient staff 7 to carry out the functions of the Center under subsection 8 (b), including— 9 "(1) a general officer (as defined in section 10 101(b) of this title) with significant experience and 11 expertise on the protection of civilians; and 12 "(2) analysts and investigators detailed from 13 the Department of State, the United States Agency 14 for International Development, the Central Intel-15 ligence Agency, and civil society organizations. 16 "(e) ACCESS TO INTELLIGENCE.—The Center shall be provided with access, in accordance with applicable pro-17 18 visions of law, to all intelligence and other reporting pos-19 sessed or acquired by the United States Government per-20 taining to harm to civilians resulting from United States 21 military operations. 22 "(f) ANNUAL REPORTS.—(1) At the direction of the 23 Secretary of Defense, the Director of the Center shall sub-

25 mittee on Foreign Relations of the Senate, and the Com-

mit to the congressional defense committees, the Com-

19

mittee on Foreign Affairs of the House of Representatives
 an annual report on the activities of the Center. The Di rector shall also publish an unclassified form of the report
 on an internet website of the Department available to the
 public concurrently with its submission to Congress.

6 "(2) Each report required by paragraph (1) shall in-7 clude a discussion of—

8 "(A) the activities of the Center and its
9 progress toward implementing the functions of the
10 Center under subsection (b);

"(B) the assessment of the Director of United
States Government policies and practices for civilian
harm prevention, mitigation, and response;

14 "(C) the recommendations of the Director for
15 improved civilian harm prevention, mitigation, and
16 response policies and practices; and

17 "(D) the recommendations of the Director for 18 any legislative or other actions necessary to improve 19 the ability of the Center to carry out its functions.". 20 "(g) GUIDANCE.—Not later than 120 days after the 21 date of the enactment of this section, the Director of the 22 Center shall, at the direction of the Secretary of Defense 23 and in consultation with civilian victims and survivors, de-24 velop further guidance on the provision of amends or con-

20

dolences for harm to civilians, including monetary and
 non-monetary mechanisms.

3 "(h) FUNDS.—For each of fiscal years 2023 through 4 2025, there is authorized to be appropriated for the De-5 partment of Defense \$25,000,000 for the Director to 6 carry out the functions specified in subsections (a) 7 through (g).".

8 (b) CLERICAL AMENDMENT.—The table of sections 9 at the beginning of such chapter is amended by inserting 10 after the item relating to section 147 the following new 11 item:

"148. Center of Excellence for the Protection of Civilians.".

12 SEC. 8. REPORT ON DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE PRACTICES
13 REGARDING DISTINCTION BETWEEN COM14 BATANTS AND CIVILIANS IN UNITED STATES
15 MILITARY OPERATIONS.

(a) REPORT.—The Secretary of Defense shall seek to
enter into an agreement with a federally funded research
and development center to conduct an independent report
on Department of Defense practices regarding distinguishing between combatants and civilians in United
States military operations.

(b) ELEMENTS.—The report required under sub-section (a) shall include the following matters:

(1) A description of how the Department of De-fense and individual members of the Armed Forces

1	have differentiated between combatants and civilians
2	in both ground and air operations since 2001, in-
3	cluding in Afghanistan, Iraq, Syria, Somalia, Libya,
4	and Yemen, including—
5	(A) relevant policy and legal standards and
6	how these standards were implemented in prac-
7	tice;
8	(B) target engagement criteria; and
9	(C) whether military-aged males were pre-
10	sumptively targetable.
11	(2) A description of how the Department of De-
12	fense has differentiated between combatants and ci-
13	vilians when assessing allegations of civilian casual-
14	ties since 2001, including in Afghanistan, Iraq,
15	Syria, Somalia, Libya, and Yemen, including—
16	(A) relevant policy and legal standards and
17	the factual indicators these standards were ap-
18	plied to in assessing claims of civilian casual-
19	ties; and
20	(B) any other matters the Secretary of De-
21	fense determines appropriate.
22	(c) SUBMISSION OF REPORT.—
23	(1) IN GENERAL.—Not later than July 1, 2023,
24	the Secretary of Defense shall submit to the con-
25	gressional defense committees a report setting forth

1	an unaltered copy of the assessment under this sec-
2	tion, together with the views of the Secretary on the
3	assessment.
4	(2) FORM OF REPORT.—The report under para-
5	graph (1) shall be submitted in unclassified form,
6	but may contain a classified- annex.
7	SEC. 9. DEFINITIONS.
8	In this Act:
9	(1) CIVILIAN HARM.—The term "harm", with
10	respect to civilians, means—
11	(A) injury to, death of, or destruction of
12	property of civilians; and
13	(B) any other harm to civilians caused as
14	a result of the use of force.
15	(2) Congressional defense committees.—
16	The term "congressional defense committees" has
17	the meaning given the term in section $101(a)(16)$ of
18	title 10, United States Code.
19	(3) UNITED STATES MILITARY OPERATIONS.—
20	The term "United States military operations" in-
21	cludes any mission, strike, engagement, raid, or inci-
22	dent involving United States Armed Forces.